

MINUTES DECEMBER 20, 2022

GRAND RAPIDS HOUSING COMMISSION

The regular meeting of the Grand Rapids Housing Commission was held on December 20, 2022 in the community room of Campau Commons at 821 Division South, Grand Rapids, Michigan. The President called the meeting to order at 6:04 p.m.

Roll Call: Present: Alexander, Bernier, Steimle-App, Zylstra

Absent: Miles

The President declared a quorum present.

Also attending: Executive Director Lindsey Reames, Business Intelligence Analyst Jose Capeles, and Amanda Pierce.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There were no public comments.

MINUTES:

Commissioner Bernier, supported by Commissioner Zylstra, moved to approve the Minutes of the regular meeting of November 15, 2022.

Ayes: Alexander, Bernier, Steimle-App, Zylstra

Nays: None

The President declared the motion carried.

RESOLUTIONS & MOTIONS:

1. The President presented the Commission with a copy of the resolution approving the financial statements for period ending November 30, 2022.

22-49 The following resolution was introduced and considered:

**Resolution to Approve Financial Dashboard Reports that reflect the
Operating Statement of Income and Expenditures**

WHEREAS, the Operating Statement of Income and Expenditures for the period ended November 30, 2022 has been prepared for and reviewed by Executive Staff at the Grand Rapids Housing Commission; and

WHEREAS, this information has been prepared for the Housing Commission Board in a financial dashboard format; and

WHEREAS, the Housing Commission staff and Board, in its review, has determined that the expenditures are appropriate for the efficient and economical operation of the Housing Commission for the purpose of serving low income families.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS OF THE GRAND RAPIDS HOUSING COMMISSION, that the Operating Statement of Income and Expenditures as represented in the dashboards for the period ended November 30, 2022 are in all respects approved.

Commissioner Zylstra, supported by Commissioner Bernier, moved adoption of the foregoing resolution.

Ayes: Alexander, Bernier, Steimle-App, Zylstra

Nays: None

The President declared the motion carried.

2. The President presented the Commission with a copy of the resolution approving Antoine Court audit.

22-50 The following resolution was introduced and considered:

**Resolution to Approve Audited Financial Statements
for Antoine Court LDHA Limited Partnership for Calendar Year Ended**

December 31, 2021

WHEREAS, the Grand Rapids Housing Commission contracted with the audit firm Plante Moran to prepare audited financial statements for the calendar year ended December 31, 2021; and

WHEREAS, Plante Moran has completed their audit and issued draft statements Antoine Court LDHA Limited Partnership for the year ended December 31, 2021; and

WHEREAS, the Housing Commission, has reviewed the statements and has determined that the report fairly presents the financial conditions of the partnerships

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS OF THE GRAND RAPIDS HOUSING COMMISSION, that the audited financial statements for Antoine Court LDHA Limited Partnership for the year ended December 31, 2021 is in all respects approved.

Commissioner Alexander, supported by Commissioner Bernier, moved adoption of the foregoing resolution.

Ayes: Alexander, Bernier, Steimle-App, Zylstra

Nays: None

The President declared the motion carried.

3. The President presented the Commission with a copy of the resolution approving Antoine Court and Creston Plaza I & II operating budgets.

22-51 The following resolution was introduced and considered:

**Resolution to Approve Operating Budgets for Antoine Court and Creston Plaza I/II for
Calendar Year 2023**

WHEREAS, an operating budget for the fiscal year beginning January 1, 2023 and ending December 31, 2023, for these properties has been prepared and submitted to the Grand Rapids Housing Commission; and

WHEREAS, the Housing Commission, in its review, has determined that the proposed expenditures are necessary in the efficient and economical operation of the Housing Commission for the purpose of serving low income families.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS OF THE GRAND RAPIDS HOUSING COMMISSION, that the proposed operating budget for the fiscal year end December 31, 2023 for Antoine Court and Creston Plaza I and II are approved.

Commissioner Zylstra, supported by Commissioner Bernier, moved adoption of the foregoing resolution.

Ayes: Alexander, Bernier, Steimle-App, Zylstra

Nays: None

The President declared the motion carried.

4. The President presented the Commission with a copy of the resolution approving jurisdiction expansion.

22-52 The following resolution was introduced and considered:

Resolution to Approve Jurisdiction Expansion

WHEREAS, the City of Grand Rapids will have a need for an estimated 5,340 additional rental units by 2025 to keep pace with demand and over 17,000 renter households are estimated to be spending more than 30% of their gross income on housing expenses as reported by Housing Next; and

WHEREAS, the Grand Rapids Housing Commission (GRHC) success rate for voucher holders seeking housing

in Kent County is 30-40%, meaning 3-4 in 10 households find affordable housing in the jurisdiction; and

WHEREAS, the Ottawa County Housing Commission does not have HUD funding or authorization to operate a Housing Choice Voucher program in their locality; and

WHEREAS, other factors were considered when evaluating a jurisdiction expansion including tax credit application options for developers; rental properties that overlap Kent and Ottawa counties; and households currently commuting from Ottawa to Kent county for employment opportunities; and

WHEREAS, HUD has requested GRHC to administer vouchers from a HUD funded property located in Ottawa County “opting out” of their current HAP contract;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS OF THE GRAND RAPIDS HOUSING COMMISSION that the GRHC jurisdiction expansion to include both Kent and Ottawa Counties is approved. Furthermore, the Executive Director is authorized to modify existing policies and procedures to incorporate the expansion provisions including but not limited to the Administrative Plan and payment standards.

Commissioner Bernier, supported by Commissioner Alexander, moved adoption of the foregoing resolution.

Ayes: Alexander, Bernier, Steimle-App, Zylstra

Nays: None

The President declared the motion carried.

5. The President stepped aside for the consideration of following resolution. The Vice President presented the Commission with a copy of the resolution approving negotiations with Brinshore Development.

22-53 The following resolution was introduced and considered:

**Resolution to Authorize Negotiations with Brinshore Development for
a Development Consultant/Partner Agreement**

WHEREAS, the Grand Rapids Housing Commission (GRHC) issued a Request for Qualifications for a Development Consultant/Partner on October 5, 2022, with proposals due November 4, 2022, to assist with asset repositioning for Adams Park and other rehabilitation and new development for the GRHC portfolio of assets; and

WHEREAS, GRHC received four (4) responses from:

1. MDG/CSG Advisors (November 3rd at 11:00 am)
2. Housing Solutions (November 3rd at 11:00 am)
3. Brinshore Development/AMPLIFY GR (November 3rd at 1:00 pm)
4. Galvan Team (November 4th at 8:25 am) and

WHEREAS, the proposals/responses were reviewed and independently scored in round one for “competitive” range) by the following evaluation team:

1. Michael Weaver, GRHC Development Coordinator
2. Felicia Clay, GRHC Director of Asset Management
3. Betty Zylstra, GRHC Board Vice Chair
4. Helen Lehman, Executive Director, New Development
5. Connie Bohatch, Senior Managing Director of Community Services for the City of Grand Rapids

WHEREAS, the evaluation team determined three (3) proposals—MDG/CSG Advisors; Brinshore Development/AMPLIFY GR; and Galvan Team scored in the competitive range (80 – 100 points) and would move to round two for a presentation/interview; and

WHEREAS, presentations and interviews were conducted virtually on December 6, 2022, by the evaluation team and by which each proposer had no more than one hour to complete the presentation and the interview questions; and

WHEREAS, the evaluation team determined from round two that the two strongest proposals were MDG/CSG Advisors and Brinshore Development/AMPLIFY GR with scores over 85 and within two points. The evaluation team then identified and discussed the areas of most important to GRHC from the evaluation criteria (strengths of the proposals and interviews; relocation plans; and MBE/WBE past success); and

WHEREAS, the evaluation team is recommending that GRHC begin negotiations with Brinshore/AMPLIFY GR; and

WHEREAS, if negotiations are unsuccessful with Brinshore/AMPLIFY GR, the evaluation team is recommending that GRHC begin negotiations with MDG/CSG Advisors;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS OF THE GRAND RAPIDS HOUSING COMMISSION that the GRHC staff is authorized to negotiate a development consultant/partner agreement/contract with Brinshore/AMPLIFY and present a final award recommendation to the Board. Staff are further authorized to negotiate an agreement with MDG/CSG Advisors should negotiations with Brinshore Development/AMPLIFY not result in a contract recommendation to the Board.

Commissioner Bernier, supported by Commissioner Miles, moved adoption of the foregoing resolution.

Ayes: Alexander, Bernier, Zylstra

Nays: None

Abstentions: Steimle-App

The Vice President declared the motion carried.

6. The President presented the Commission with a copy of the resolution approving worker's compensation.

22-54 The following resolution was introduced and considered:

Resolution to Approve Worker's Compensation

WHEREAS, the Grand Rapids Housing Commission (GRHC) provides worker's compensation for employees in accordance with the Workers' Disability Compensation Act and;

WHEREAS, GRHC has completed the annual evaluation of options from various providers and;

WHEREAS, GRHC has elected to continue to offer worker's compensation through Accident Fund Insurance Company of America and;

WHEREAS, the annual premium decreased by \$5.00 for a total Agency's annual cost of \$12,493 and;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS OF THE GRAND RAPIDS HOUSING COMMISSION that the Executive Director is hereby authorized and approved to execute a contract to continue using Accident Fund Insurance Company of America for our worker's compensation

Commissioner Bernier, supported by Commissioner Alexander, moved adoption of the foregoing resolution.

Ayes: Alexander, Bernier, Steimle-App, Zylstra

Nays: None

The President declared the motion carried.

7. The President presented the Commission with a copy of the resolution approving organizational structure.

22-55 The following resolution was introduced and considered:

Resolution to Approve Organizational Structure for the Grand Rapids

Housing Commission

WHEREAS, the Grand Rapids Housing Commission (GRHC) Board approved an “Optimal Operational Organization” on August 17, 2021; and

WHEREAS, additional revisions to operating procedures and restructuring of roles and responsibilities have continued to maximize efficiencies and minimize duplication of efforts to improve customer satisfaction; and

WHEREAS, the current organizational structure does not meet the staffing needs of the GRHC, align staff with preferred reporting structures and responsibilities or follow industry best practices; and

WHEREAS, a new organization structure for HCV, Asset Management and Administration departments (attached) is being proposed to diversify the departments to provide high level customer service and addresses current and near future staffing needs; and

WHEREAS, positions will be filled only as financial resources are available to support the staffing need; and

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS OF THE GRAND RAPIDS HOUSING COMMISSION that the revised organizational structure for HCV, Asset Management and Administration departments presented by the Executive Director is approved and may be executed with adequate funding to ensure the GRHC is maximizing efficiencies, minimizing duplication of effort, and reporting structures align, adequate staff are available to provide high level customer service and addresses current and near future staffing needs.

Commissioner Zylstra, supported by Commissioner Bernier, moved adoption of the foregoing resolution.

Ayes: Alexander, Bernier, Steimle-App, Zylstra

Nays: None

The President declared the motion carried.

8. The President presented the Commission with a copy of the resolution approving utility allowance schedule.

22-56 The following resolution was introduced and considered:

Resolution to approve the CY 2023 Utility Allowance Schedule

WHEREAS, the Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) requires that the Grand Rapids Housing Commission (GRHC) maintain a utility allowance schedule for all tenant-paid utilities (except telephone), as required in 24 CFR 982.517(a), and

WHEREAS, HUD requires that the GRHC review the utility allowances each year, and must revise its allowance for a utility category if there has been a change of 10% or more in the utility rate since the last utility rate was revised, as required in 24 CFR 982.517(c), and

WHEREAS, it has been determined that rates for Natural Gas have increased by more than 21% per month, a revision and adoption of a new utility allowance schedule is required.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS OF THE GRAND RAPIDS HOUSING COMMISSION that the attached CY 2023 Utility Allowance Schedule, effective March 1st, 2023 is approved.

Commissioner Alexander, supported by Commissioner Bernier, moved adoption of the foregoing resolution.

Ayes: Alexander, Bernier, Steimle-App, Zylstra

Nays: None

The President declared the motion carried.

9. The President presented the Commission with a copy of the resolution approving procurement of copiers.

22-57 The following resolution was introduced and considered:

**Resolution for Procurement of Multi-Function Copiers for
Replacement of Aged Equipment**

WHEREAS, the Grand Rapids Housing Commission staff have identified the need for replacement of out of support and obsolete Multi-Function Copier equipment at the following locations: Mt Mercy I and II, Ransom Tower Apartments, Antoine Court Apartments, Campau Commons, HCV FSS, Leonard Terrace Apartments, Creston Plaza Apartments, Adams Park Apartments; and

WHEREAS, the immediate replacement of this equipment will continue to aid in the ability for staff to efficiently perform duties as assigned and keep costs under control avoiding costly and repetitive repairs to equipment; and

WHEREAS, an initial quote has provided a footprint of the hardware and labor needed to properly install the equipment needed, staff will secure at least two additional quotes to ensure a competitive price; and

WHEREAS, GRHC desires approval to proceed with final quotes and to procure 8 new Multi-Functions Copiers for the aforementioned sites/departments;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS OF THE GRAND RAPIDS HOUSING COMMISSION the Executive Director is authorized to complete the procurement of the products needed for 8 new Multi-Function Copiers and to execute a contract in an amount not to exceed \$55,000.

Commissioner Bernier, supported by Commissioner Zylstra, moved adoption of the foregoing resolution.

Ayes: Alexander, Bernier, Steimle-App, Zylstra

Nays: None

The President declared the motion carried.

10. The President presented the Commission with a copy of the resolution approving Notice of Intent for Hope Community.

22-58 The following resolution was introduced and considered:

**Resolution to Authorize Submission of Neighborhood Investment Plan, HOME-ARP, and
ERRIS Process Notice of Intent Application**

WHEREAS, On December 1, 2022, the City of Grand Rapids, Community Development Department published the Neighborhood Investment Plan, HOME-ARP, and ERRIS Process, Notice of Intent Application. This funding opportunity is to assist communities in their continued efforts to address homelessness, improve access to and stability of affordable housing, increase supply of affordable housing, improving the condition of existing housing, foster engaged, connected and resilient neighborhoods, improve community safety, improve economic opportunity, and enhance neighborhood infrastructure.

WHEREAS, the Grand Rapids Housing Commission (GRHC) operates and maintains the Hope Community Rapid Re-Housing program for homeless families. Hope Community receives funding through the Continuum of Care (CoC) for intensive case management services for homeless families to eliminate the barriers to seeking affordable housing; and

WHEREAS, Hope Community does not receive adequate federal funds to maintain the operations and rehabilitate a 30-year-old building. Hope Community fulfills a tremendous need in the community but is in jeopardy of being able to provide decent, safe, and affordable housing if financial resources for rehabilitation are not available in the near future.

WHEREAS, the Notice of Intent Application had a submission deadline of December 16, 2022, prior to the board meeting, GRHC did not want to miss the opportunity so submitted the Notice of Intent, but now request the Boards consent and authorization to respond to the Request for Proposal if invited by the City to do so.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS OF THE GRAND RAPIDS HOUSING COMMISSION that the Board acknowledges the submission of the NOI to the City with no concerns and authorize the Executive Director to submit a Notice of Intent application to complete the additional steps outlined in the Neighborhood Investment Plan, HOME-ARP, and ERRIS Process including responding to the RFP.

Commissioner Zylstra, supported by Commissioner Alexander, moved adoption of the foregoing resolution.

Ayes: Alexander, Bernier, Steimle-App, Zylstra

Nays: None

The President declared the motion carried.

11. The President presented the Commission with a copy of the resolution approving Ransom Tower bedbug prevention contract.

22-59 The following resolution was introduced and considered:

Resolution to Approve Ransom Tower Bedbugs Preventive Maintenance Agreement

WHEREAS, Ransom Tower is a Multifamily development for low-income seniors and the Housing Commission is responsible for providing decent, sanitary, and safe housing for seniors; and

WHEREAS, bedbug infestations have become a serious problem in housing throughout the country and GRHC properties are not immune to infestations, anyone or any home can get

bedbugs. Bedbugs live on human and animal blood and typically hide and live in cracks and crevices in dark and undisturbed locations close to their hosts. They can live for long periods of time and although visible to the naked eye, they may be difficult to detect; and

WHEREAS, early identification and reporting of infestations by residents to building management limits the spread of bedbugs. The longer you wait the more likely the problem is to spread and the more difficult and costly it will be to control; and

WHEREAS, Ransom Tower has a contract with Griffin for pest control services. Due to an increase in bedbug cases, the Housing Commission has an opportunity to select a Preventative Maintenance Plan as an additional treatment measure to stop the infestation. This plan includes but is not limited to the following: an initial inspection with a canine to identify the infestation, quarterly, and all the necessary treatments at no additional cost should the prevention measures not eliminate infestation in units or common areas and a Preparation Checklist to help residents successfully prep for treatments.

WHEREAS, GRHC staff have determined that it is necessary to implement a Preventive Maintenance Plan to adequately address the cases of bed bugs at Ransom Tower Apartments.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS OF THE GRAND RAPIDS HOUSING COMMISSION authorize that the Executive Director is to execute the Preventive Maintenance contract for 1 year for an annual fee of \$33,048, effective January 1st, 2023.

Commissioner Bernier, supported by Commissioner Alexander, moved adoption of the foregoing resolution.

Ayes: Alexander, Bernier, Steimle-App, Zylstra

Nays: None

The President declared the motion carried.

12. The President presented the Commission with a copy of the resolution approving HVAC contract awards.

22-60 The following resolution was introduced and considered:

**Resolution to Award Contracts for Boiler and HVAC
Preventive Maintenance Services and Repairs**

WHEREAS, the Housing Commission is required under the Procurement Policy to seek competitive bids to ensure that supplies and services are procured efficiently, effectively, and at the most favorable prices; and

WHEREAS, the Housing Commission has recently circulated Requests for Proposals for Boiler and HVAC Preventive Maintenance and Repair Services for all the housing developments; and

WHEREAS, the Housing Commission has reviewed the bid submissions and has determined that it is in the organization’s best interest to accept the bid submitted by Advantage, Hurst, and R& R Mechanical, as all were deemed responsive and responsible.

Company Name	Business Hours	After 5:00 Weekends	Holiday Rate	Annual Fee	Trip Fee	Mark Up	Cost Savings
Hurst	\$129	\$175	\$239	\$0	\$50-\$75	30%	PM -10% Invoice-0%
R& R	\$120	\$160	\$195	\$0	\$0	34%	PM- 10% Repairs-25%
Advantage	\$85	\$170	\$170	\$0	\$65	15%	PM- 0% Repairs-4%

WHEREAS, each of the selected contractors will be assigned to a development as follows;

Advantage Mechanical (Adams Park, Antoine Court, Ransom Tower, and the Main Office),

Hurst Mechanical (Leonard Terrace and Mt. Mercy) and R&R Mechanical (Campau, Creston

Plaza, Hope Community, Scattered Sites and Sheldon Apartments); and

WHEREAS, the services will be under a 2-year contract term, with an option for the Housing Commission to renew for 3 additional one-year terms, not to exceed 5 years; and

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS OF THE GRAND RAPIDS HOUSING COMMISSION that the Executive Director is hereby authorized to negotiate and execute a contract with Advantage, Hurst, and R&R Mechanical for Boiler and HVAC Preventive Maintenance Services.

Commissioner Zylstra, supported by Commissioner Alexander, moved adoption of the foregoing resolution.

Ayes: Alexander, Bernier, Steimle-App, Zylstra

Nays: None

The President declared the motion carried.

13. The President presented the Commission with a copy of the resolution approving RFP for Project Based Vouchers.

22-61 The following resolution was introduced and considered:

**Resolution to Approving Issuance of
Request for Proposals of Project-Based Vouchers**

WHEREAS, the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) granted the Grand Rapids Housing Commission the authority to convert up to an additional 200 Housing Choice Vouchers (HCV) to Project-Based Vouchers (PBV) on October 19, 2022 to assist in the provision of affordable housing and these vouchers are allocated through competitive and non-competitive processes which are reviewed and approved by HUD; and

WHEREAS, the Housing Commission works with housing developers and owners to assist in the community's efforts to serve low-income households, special needs populations, and/or

underserved areas by providing affordable housing opportunities through the utilization of project-based vouchers; and

WHEREAS, staff requests approval to prepare and circulate a Request for Proposals for the purpose of awarding one hundred (100) project-based vouchers to aid in the affordability and financing of existing, rehabilitated, and new construction housing projects.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED BY THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS OF THE GRAND RAPIDS HOUSING COMMISSION that the Executive Director is authorized to prepare and circulate a Request for Proposals for the purpose of awarding PBVs and further be authorized to execute Housing Assistance Payment contracts with those entities awarded PBVs. Commissioner Bernier, supported by Commissioner Zylstra, moved adoption of the foregoing resolution.

Ayes: Alexander, Bernier, Steimle-App, Zylstra

Nays: None

The President declared the motion carried.

14. The President presented the Commission with a copy of the resolution approving flat rents at Adams Park.

22-62 The following resolution was introduced and considered:

Resolution to Approve the Flat Rents for Public Housing Programs

WHEREAS, the Grand Rapids Housing Commission (GRHC) utilizes 80% of Fair Market Rents (FMR) annually published by the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) for the Grand Rapids-Wyoming, MI HUD Metro FMR Area (Local Area) to determine Flat Rent amounts for its Low-Income Public Housing (LIPH) Programs; and

WHEREAS, HUD published the FY 2023 Fair Market Rents, and it must be implemented

by the GRHC within 3 months following the October 1st, 2022, effective date: and

WHEREAS, the Consolidated Appropriations Act of 2014, required PHAs to establish flat rents at no less than 80 percent of the applicable Fair Market Rent (FMR), and established rent increase phase-in requirements to prevent family rental payments from increasing by more than 35 percent.

WHEREAS, GRHC staff has determined that it will need to implement a Flat Rent amount to 80% of the 2023 Fair Market Rents from \$713 to \$804 for residents residing at Adams Park and Scattered Sites (LIPH) to be competitive in the Kent County area.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS OF THE GRAND RAPIDS HOUSING COMMISSION that the FY 2023 Flat Rent at 80% of the Fair Market Rent for LIPH units, effective January 1st, 2023, is approved.

Commissioner Bernier, supported by Commissioner Alexander, moved adoption of the foregoing resolution.

Ayes: Alexander, Bernier, Steimle-App, Zylstra

Nays: None

The President declared the motion carried.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

1. The Executive Director presented the Board with a copy of the Vacancy and Voucher dashboard reports for November 2022.
2. The Executive Director presented the Board with a copy of the Personnel Report for November 2022.
3. The Executive Director informed the Board that HUD has authorized payment of previous year OCAF for Creston using HAP reserves in the amount of \$160,698 (Phase I is

\$93,416 and Phase II is \$67,282). HUD issued an additional HAP payment in this amount. Staff have discussed with the investor/partner and they identified no issues with receipt of these payments by the end of the calendar year.

4. The Executive Director distributed the 2023 meeting schedule to the Board.

5. The Executive Director informed the Board that resident concerns at Ransom Tower that were brought to the Board at the October meeting are being addressed. The pest control issue is addressed in resolution 2022-59 and hiring a security firm for roaming patrols is being considered at Ransom and other sites.

6. The Executive Director informed the Board of the travel schedule for the first quarter of 2023.

The President declared the meeting adjourned at 6:51 pm.

Lindsey S. Reames

Executive Director